

Application reference: 19/2047/FUL MORTLAKE, BARNES COMMON WARD

Date application received	Date made valid	Target report date	8 Week date
02.07.2019	30.07.2019	24.09.2019	24.09.2019

E.o.T. requested to 06.03.2020

Site:

Barnes Methodist Church, Station Road, Barnes, London

Proposal:

Installation of photo-voltaic solar panels on roof slope in association with re-covering of roof.

Status: Pending Consideration (If status = HOLD please check that all is OK before you proceed any further with this application)

APPLICANT NAME

The Mananging Trustees
Barnes Methodist Church
Station Road
Barnes
London
SW13 0NH

AGENT NAME

Mr David Ensom
12 Whitedown Road
Tadley
RG26 4BY

DC Site Notice: printed on 06.08.2019 and posted on 16.08.2019 and due to expire on 06.09.2019

Consultations:

Internal/External:

Consultee

14D Urban D

Expiry Date

20.08.2019

Neighbours:

62 Station Road, Barnes, London, SW13 0LP, - 06.08.2019
60 Station Road, Barnes, London, SW13 0LP, - 06.08.2019
58 Station Road, Barnes, London, SW13 0LP, - 06.08.2019
56 Station Road, Barnes, London, SW13 0LP, - 06.08.2019
54 Station Road, Barnes, London, SW13 0LP, - 06.08.2019
Church Flat, 3 Station Road, Barnes, London, SW13 0LP, - 06.08.2019
The Barnes Village Nursery By The Pond, 3A Station Road, Barnes, London, SW13 0LP, - 06.08.2019

History: Development Management, Appeals, Building Control, Enforcements:

Development Management

Status: GTD Application: 01/2592
Date: 06/12/2001 Creation Of New Single Fire Exit Door In North East Elevation; Construction Of Bin Store On South West Elevation.

Development Management

Status: GTD Application: 94/1559/FUL
Date: 12/08/1994 Re-surfacing Of Area Used As A Childrens Playground

Development Management

Status: GTD Application: 97/0011
Date: 18/03/1997 Provision Of Wheelchair Ramp Access COMMENTS: DISABLED APPLICATION

Development Management

Status: WDN Application: 97/0720
Date: 02/02/1998 Demolition Of Existing Sunday School And Ancillary Buildings.

Development Management

Status: WDN
Date:02/02/1998

Application:97/0732
Demolition Of Existing Sunday School And Ancillary Buildings And Erection Of Six Two Bedroom Flats And Two 2 Bedroom Maisonettes With Garaging On Site For Ten Cars. Internal Alterations To Church To Create New Nave And Meeting Rooms With Ne

Development Management

Status: WTD
Date:23/08/2001

Application:99/2931
Replacement Of Existing Freestanding Signs.

Development Management

Status: GTD
Date:25/06/2008

Application:08/1227/FUL
Re-surface the play area abutting Barnes Green, (on the east side of Barnes Methodist Church) with impact absorbing surfacing.

Development Management

Status: GTD
Date:23/11/2009

Application:09/2096/FUL
Remove two small steps in front of an unused door and placement of four bicycle parking hoops in the forecourt of the church.

Development Management

Status: PCO
Date:

Application:19/2047/FUL
Installation of photo-voltaic solar panels on roof slope in association with re-covering of roof.

Appeal

Validation Date: 23.08.2000
Reference: 99/2931

Development Appeal

Building Control

Deposit Date: 12.10.2004
Reference: 04/2099/FP

New first floor structure, internal alterations and refitting works.

Building Control

Deposit Date: 10.02.2005
Reference: 04/2099/RS1/FP

New first floor structure, internal alterations and refitting works.

Building Control

Deposit Date: 09.05.2008
Reference: 08/0975/BN

Flat at Barnes Methodist Church: Internal alterations to existing flat including removal of chimney breasts, new bathroom, kitchen and general renovation

Building Control

Deposit Date: 07.10.2011
Reference: 12/FEN00069/GASAFE

Installed a Gas Boiler

Enforcement

Opened Date: 19.12.2007
Reference: 07/0560/EN/ADV

Enforcement Enquiry

Enforcement

Opened Date: 20.12.2012
Reference: 12/0677/EN/EOP

Enforcement Enquiry

19/2047/FUL

BA

R WARD

BARNES METHODIST CHURCH

Contact officer:

**STATION ROAD
BARNES**

Jim Thomson

Proposal:

Installation of photo-voltaic solar panels on the western-facing roof slope in association with re-covering of roof in slate.

Main Development plan policies:

Local Plan:

LP 1 (Local Character and Design Quality);
LP 3 (Designated Heritage Assets);
LP 4 (Non-designated Heritage Assets);
LP 22 (Sustainable Design and Construction).

Supplementary Planning Documents:

'Sustainable Construction Checklist'
'Barnes Village Plan'.

Other documents:

'Barnes Green Conservation Area Study'.

Present use:

Church

Site description and relevant planning history:

The application site comprises a substantial red-brick late-Gothic Edwardian church, occupying a prominent site on the eastern side of Station Road, on the south-western edge of Barnes Green. The building is not listed but is designated as a Building of Townscape Merit and is located within the Ham House Conservation Area.

Public and other representations:

Two representations received, supporting the proposal.

Professional comment

The National Planning Policy Framework confirms the presumption in favour of sustainable development but reiterates that applications must be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations dictate otherwise. It particularly stresses the importance of design in the consideration of development proposals.

The main issues are considered to be those of design and the impact on the character and appearance of the BTM, the street scene and the conservation area.

DESIGN

The host building is located within the Barnes Green Conservation Area. The duty under section 72 of the Planning Listed Building and Conservation Areas Act 1990 is to pay "*special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character*".

Section 16 of the NPPF deals with conserving and enhancing the historic environment. Paragraph 189 states:

"In determining applications, local planning authorities should require an applicant to describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting. The level of detail should be proportionate to the assets' importance and no more than is sufficient to understand the potential impact of the proposal on their significance."

Paragraph 193 of the NPPF states that:

"When considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation."

Paragraph 195 states:

"Where a proposed development will lead to substantial harm to (or total loss of significance of) a designated heritage asset, local planning authorities should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or total loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh that harm or loss, or all of the following apply:

- a) the nature of the heritage asset prevents all reasonable uses of the site; and*
- b) no viable use of the heritage asset itself can be found in the medium term through appropriate marketing that will enable its conservation; and*
- c) conservation by grant-funding or some form of not for profit, charitable or public ownership is demonstrably not possible; and*
- d) the harm or loss is outweighed by the benefit of bringing the site back into use."*

Paragraph 197 states:

"The effect of an application on the significance of a non-designated heritage asset should be taken into account in determining the application. In weighing applications that directly or indirectly affect non-designated heritage assets, a balanced judgement will be required having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the heritage asset."

Local Plan policy LP 1 seeks to protect areas of high quality such as this conservation area from inappropriate development. All new development should recognise distinctive local character and contribute to creating places of a high architectural and urban design quality that are well used and valued, be sustainable, respect the space between buildings and relationship with the public realm and use appropriate detailing and materials

Local Plan policy LP 3 seeks to protect and, where possible, enhance the character and appearance of conservation areas, whilst policy LP 4 seeks to protect the character, appearance and setting of BTMs.

Policy LP 22 deals with sustainable design and construction and, in general terms, seeks to mitigate against climate change by incorporating measures to improve energy conservation and efficiency as well as contribute to renewable and low carbon energy generation. Opportunities micro-generation of renewable energy through retrofitting will be supported in line with other policies in the Plan. However, paragraph 6.3.23 of the Plan states that the sensitivity of existing developments, in particular heritage assets, in terms of their historic fabric and significance, should be considered before developing methods in which to retrofit higher standards of energy and water efficiency.

Although not specifically mentioned in the Barnes Village Plan or the Barnes Green Conservation Area Statement, the existing building is a non-designated heritage asset of some significance, located in a prominent location in one of the Council's original conservation areas. It sits adjacent to Barnes Green which is identified in the Barnes Village Plan and the Conservation Area Statement, as one of the key features of the conservation

area. The building is constructed of red brick with stone window and door surrounds and a steep pitched slate-clad roof.

The proposal involves the re-slatting of the roof and the installation of photo-voltaic panels on the greater part of the west-facing roof. There is a concurrent application for photo-voltaic tiles to be installed on the greater part of the west-facing roof slope and on the south-facing slope of the transept roof.

Although the building is sited at the back-edge of the pavement, facing Station Road, the western roof slope is clearly visible from street level, including the pavement opposite, and in longer views within the conservation area.

The proposal has been reviewed by the Council's Conservation Officer, who comments as follows:

"This BTM in a CA is a late Gothic Edwardian Church with a distinct and imposing presence in Station Rd and facing Barnes Green. It is red brick with stone detailing and a slate roof. This roof is clearly visible from the street and the building also faces a row of historic buildings on the opposite side of the street which are much older than the church and part of the original historic centre of Barnes.

The addition of a significant number of proposed PV panels to the south western roof slope would significantly alter the architectural character of the building and be in conflict with it. These additions would also be highly damaging to the wider character of the conservation area as the roof is seen from a number of public viewpoints. We would therefore conclude that the proposals would result in significant harm to the roof of a landmark BTM in a prominent location and would have a major visual impact on the character of the conservation area in one of the oldest areas of Barnes Village. We recommend refusal as the proposals would conflict with Local Plan policies LP1 and LP3-5, as well as sections 193-197 of the NPPF.

As an alternative we would suggest that the church take a more whole building approach to sustainability and energy efficiency as per EH guidance:- <https://historicengland.org.uk/advice/technical-advice/energy-efficiency-and-historic-buildings/>."

The Church's aspiration to reduce its carbon footprint is to be applauded and is consistent with the Council's sustainability policies set out in LP 22, which, in the case of existing buildings, seek to achieve high levels of energy efficiency through retrofitting. However, this needs to be balanced with the national and local policy objectives of protecting the character and appearance of the building and the surrounding conservation area.

Whilst the exact design of the proposed photo-voltaic panels has not been specified, the application provides sufficient information to assess the potential impact of the installation. Although intended to be integrated into the surrounding slate roof, the panels would sit proud of the surrounding roof covering and would be prominent on the roofscape. The extent of the installation and the prominent location would result in substantial harm to the character and appearance of the church, the street scene and the wider conservation area. No public benefits have been identified by the applicants, to outweigh this substantial harm.

On this basis, the proposals are considered to be contrary to adopted policies LP 1, LP 3 and LP 4 and the NPPF.

The proposals submitted under application 19/3600/FUL are intended to address the policy objections to this scheme and are recommended for approval.

Conclusion

The proposed photo-voltaic panels, by reason of their design, extent and prominent location, would be harmful to the character and appearance of the church, which is a designated Building of Townscape Merit, to the street scene and to this part of the Barnes Green Conservation Area. No public benefits have been identified to outweigh this substantial harm.

It is accordingly recommended that permission should be **REFUSED**.

Recommendation:

The determination of this application falls within the scope of Officer delegated powers (YES) NO

I therefore recommend the following:

- 1. REFUSAL
- 2. PERMISSION
- 3. FORWARD TO COMMITTEE

This application is CIL liable YES* NO
(*If yes, complete CIL tab in Uniform)

This application requires a Legal Agreement YES* NO
(*If yes, complete Development Condition Monitoring in Uniform)

This application has representations online (which are not on the file) YES NO

This application has representations on file YES NO

Case Officer (Initials): ... J.T. ...

Dated: ... 03.03.2020 ...

I agree the recommendation:

Team Leader/Head of Development Management/Principal Planner

Dated:

This application has been subject to representations that are contrary to the officer recommendation. The Head of Development Management has considered those representations and concluded that the application can be determined without reference to the Planning Committee in conjunction with existing delegated authority.

Head of Development Management:

Dated:

[Handwritten Signature]
03/03/2020

REASONS:
CONDITIONS:
INFORMATIVES:
UDP POLICIES:
OTHER POLICIES:

The following table will populate as a quick check by running the template once items have been entered into Uniform

SUMMARY OF CONDITIONS AND INFORMATIVES

CONDITIONS

INFORMATIVES
