

#### STAG BREWERY - FURTHER ADDITIONAL VIABILITY ADDENDUM

We have issued the following documentation relating to the proposed development at Stag Brewery:

- Stag Brewery Development: Financial Viability Assessment, February 2018
- Initial response to GLA comments, 2 March 2018
- Letter in response to GL Hearn review, 15 August 2018
- Response to LB Richmond and GLA gueries, December 2018
- Further addendum viability 27 March 2019

This further additional viability addendum should be read in conjunction with the previously issued documentation. This note addresses the following specific issues raised by GLA officers at a meeting on 7 May 2019:

- 1. Further explanation on the approach to valuing the care home and assisted living units;
- 2. Further consideration of the phasing position and financing;
- 3. Consideration of the impact of a further reduction in the size of the basement car park; and
- 4. To cross-check the value attributed to the school site against the benchmark land value adopted for the wider site.

### 1. Care Home and assisted living units

### 1.1 Nursing Home

We have been advised that the maximum achievable rent for a care home in this part of London would be £1,100 per week, with an average occupancy of 85%. The EBITDA would equate to 35% of gross income which would be capitalised at 10% yield. This would generate a capital value of £170,170 per room.

National Care Standards require the following minimum space standards for care homes:

Useable space in room: 135 square feet

Ensuite: 38 square feet

• Communal space, excluding circulation: 42 square feet

Blocks 14 and 15 provide the following amount of floorspace:

Block	Gross internal area	Circulation (20% of gross)	Communal space (42 square feet per room)	Net internal area square feet	No of rooms (173 square feet per room)	Total capital value @ £170,170 per room
14	51,345	10,269	8,024	33,052	173	£29,439,410
15	50,608	10,122	7,909	32,577	188	£31,991,960

In contrast, the total values applied in the appraisal for blocks 14 and 15 are £34,144,900 and £33,654,700. If the care home element is appraised on standard metrics, the total GDV would therefore be lower.

### 1.2 Assisted living units

During the meeting on 7 May 2019, it was suggested by GLA officers that no evidence had been provided to support the values attributed to the assisted living units. This is not correct – the Savills pricing schedule that underpinned the original viability assessment considered



the values of units within blocks 13, 16 and 17. Considering their position within the development, Savills priced these units with an overall average of £950, £915 and 940 per square foot.

The net to gross ratio in these blocks is 70%, which is relatively efficient for an assisted living scheme. As observed during the 7 May meeting, GLA officers confirmed that they would expect a net to gross ratio of only 65%. We have adjusted the appraisal accordingly to 65%.

Savills have advised that there is very limited evidence on sales values for assisted living schemes in London as only one has been developed (Lifecare Battersea Place). This scheme achieved an average value of £1,117 per square foot, against an underlying average residential value of £900 per square foot. This equates to a 24% premium, although this does not account for differences in specification. Nevertheless, we have applied a 25% premium to the assisted living units in the Development. This is applied to the *inflated* residential sales values of £1,050 per square foot, taking the values for assisted living to £1,313 per square foot.

## 2. Phasing and finance costs

During the meeting on 7 May 2019, Carter Jonas suggested that Argus may not attribute all income in a phase to paying down debt when using a multi-phase modelling approach. While this may be the case when an Argus appraisal is set up to calculate a separate residual land value per phase, we have not set up our appraisal in this way. Our Argus appraisal is set up based on a single fixed land value input in Phase 1, with all subsequent phases linked to the first phase. For the avoidance of doubt, this means that all income, regardless of when it is received, is used to pay down debt and keep finance costs to a minimum. We have provided Carter Jonas with an export of the cashlow demonstrating that in any given month, the finance calculation takes account of all income received. This confirms that the effect they allude to does not apply in this case.

We have also compared the finance costs as a percentage of total costs to other major schemes. This analysis (see Table shows that the Stag Brewery finance costs are not unreasonably high in comparison to other developments.

**Table 1: Comparison of finance costs** 

Scheme	Finance costs	Total	Finance costs as a
		development	percentage of total
		costs	development costs
Skylines E14	£82,501,185	£632,442,150	13.04%
ITV studios site	£86,713,986	£701,976,291	12.35%
Haringey Heartlands	£70,235,192	£608,986,682	11.50%
Stag Brewery	£83,410,025	£750,662,025	11.10%
Westferry Printworks	£40,835,561	£406,399,994	10.04%
8 Albert Embankment	£27,692,169	£291,672,390	9.50%
Trent Park	£14,993,412	£194,196,145	7.70%
Tottenham Hale – Argent	£36,761,733	£489,037,162	7.51%

### 3. Further reduction in the size of the basement

In the Further Addendum Viability note dated 27 March 2019, we reflected a reduction in the size of basement car park of 150 units. However, we did not reflect the consequential impact this would have on sales values and sales rates.

The reduced basement provided a total of 406 spaces. We have reduced the basement cost by a further 100 spacesleaving only 306 spaces. In practice, the loss in spaces may be



greater, as cycle parking, plant and services also need to be accommodated in the basement. Assuming all the remaining spaces are made available to residents (leaving none for the commercial floorspace), this would result in a car parking ratio of 0.3:1, whereas the Council's parking standard is 1:1 provision.

### 4. Value attributed to school land

The school is located on land designated by the Council as 'Other Open Land of Townscape Importance'. In the benchmark land value, this land is attributed a value of £674,700, or £130,000 per acre based on sales of other similar sites.

In contrast, the Gerald Eve valuation of the Site for use as a school equates to £1,136,801 per acre, or 8.7 times the value used to establish the benchmark land value.

## 5. Cumulative impact of changes to appraisal

We have run a further appraisal (attached as Appendix 1) which reflects the cumulative impact of the following changes from the 13 December 2018 and 26 March 2018 submissions, summarised as follows:

- Reduction in car parking through the removal of 150 spaces;
- Removal of gym;
- Switching affordable housing tenures from 80% rent/20% intermediate to 50% rent and 50% intermediate;
- Add the value of the School land in line with Gerald Eve's valuation, which as noted above is significantly higher than the benchmark land value;
- Reflect the layout optimisation work undertaken by Squire and Partners
- Reflect LBRuT policy requirements for affordable workspace and carbon offset payments;
- Increase private residential sales values to £1,050 per square foot across all units;
- Increase value attributed to assisted living units to £1,313 per square foot across all units (a 25% premium above the inflated private residential values), despite their location;
- A further reduction in car parking spaces of 100, leaving 306 of the original 556 spaces;
- A reduction in interest rate from 7% to 6.0%;

It should be noted that this appraisal does <u>not</u> reflect the impact of the shortfall in car parking on sales values and sales rate – all assumptions in this regard are retained based on an assumption of provision of the full parking provision in the original appraisal.

The residual profit generated by the Development would be **19.13%.** As noted previously by Carter Jonas, a profit target based on 20% of private GDV, 6% on the affordable and 15% on the commercial would equate to 19.11%. A reduced profit of 17.5% on private GDV with the same profit rates on the other elements would equate to 16.88%. It is only on the basis of a significant underprovision of car parking and inflated starting sales values that the profit has increased to 19.13%. Given the evident risk of achieving the values now attributed to the private housing in the scheme, a reduction in profit could not be justified. The scheme does not generate any additional capacity to provide additional affordable housing, even on the highly optimistic assumptions now modelled.

If the residential values were to fall by just 2.5% as a result of the lack of car parking provision from the <u>inflated</u> rate of £1,050 per square foot (bearing in mind that this is significantly higher than the pricing advised by Savills based on comparable evidence) to £1,024 per square foot, the blended profit would fall to **17.28%.** This does not reflect any impact of reduced parking on the rate of sale, which would have a further downwards impact on the profit margin.

BNP Paribas Real Estate 20 June 2019



APPENDIX 1: APPRAISAL REFELCTING CUMULATIVE IMPACT OF CHANGES

# APPRAISAL SUMMARY

Stag Brewery Cumulative changes 20 June 2019

Summary Appraisal for Merged Phases 1 2 3 4 5

Currency in £

REVENUE							
Sales Valuation	Units		ft²	Rate ft <sup>2</sup>	Unit Price	Gross Sales	
Building 2 residential	101	90,8		1,050.00	944,563	95,400,900	
Building 3 residential	46	·		1,050.00	918,659	42,258,300	
Building 4 residential	20	23,50	62	1,050.00	1,237,005	24,740,100	
Building 6 residential	18	16,13	35	1,050.00	941,208	16,941,750	
Building 7 residential	71	63,32		1,050.00	936,482	66,490,200	
Building 8 residential	69			1,050.00	1,090,083	75,215,700	
Building 10 residential	26	22,48		1,050.00	908,088	23,610,300	
Plot 1B Car Parking	181		0	39.55	25,000	4,525,000	
Building 9 residential	13			1,050.00	1,130,204	14,692,650	
Building 11 residential	42 37	,		1,050.00	988,125	41,501,250	
Building 12 residential Building 13 Extracare	3 <i>i</i> 1	34,24 26,14		1,050.00 1,313.00	971,676 34,333,637	35,952,000	
Building 14 Extracare	1	35,9		1,313.00	47,191,846	34,333,637 47,191,846	
Building 15 Extracare	1	35,42		1,313.00	46,514,338	46,514,338	
Building 16 Extracare	1	41,3		1,313.00	54,259,725	54,259,725	
Building 17 Extracare	1	44,7		1,313.00	58,704,230	58,704,230	
Building 18 affordable residential	138			355.00	334,050	46,098,880	
Building 19 residential	62			1,050.00	939,902	58,273,950	
Plot 2A Car Parking	125		0	43.69	25,000	3,125,000	
Building 20 residential (houses)	16	25,5	75	1,050.00	1,678,359	26,853,750	
Building 21 residential (houses)	<u>8</u>			1,050.00	1,678,381	13,427,050	
Totals	978	823,2	73			830,110,556	
Pontal Area Summary					Initial	Net Rent	Initial
Rental Area Summary	Units	,	ft²	Rate ft <sup>2</sup>	MRV/Unit	at Sale	MRV
Building 1 Cinema	1	22,82		14.33	327,120	327,120	327,120
Plot 1A Ground rents	167			1 1.00	10	1,670	1,670
Building 2 flexible use	1	6,12	27	35.00	214,445	214,445	214,445
Builidng 4 flexible use	1	4,28		35.00	149,905	149,905	149,905
Building 5 flexible use	1	5,19	99	35.00	181,965	181,965	181,965
Plot 1B Ground rents	170				10	1,700	1,700
Building 5 office	1	18,20		40.00	730,480	730,480	730,480
Building 5 hotel	1	18,00			0	0	
Building 6 flexible use	1	4,10		35.00	143,640	143,640	143,640
Building 7 flexible use	1	5,70		35.00	201,775	201,775	201,775
Building 8 Affordable flexible use	1	4,73		30.00	142,140	142,140	142,140
Building 10 flexible use	1	2,78	80	27.50	76,450	76,450	76,450
Plot 1C Ground rents Building 9 flexible use	92 1	3,20	00	35.00	10 112,315	920 112,315	920 112,315
Building 11 flexible use	1	2,98		37.50	112,313	112,088	112,313
Building 12 flexible use	1	3,2		37.50	121,463	121,463	121,463
Totals	442	·		37.30	121,400	2,518,075	2,518,075
		101,0	. •			_,0:0,0:0	_,0:0,0:0
Investment Valuation							
Building 1 Cinema							
Market Rent	327,120			6.0000%	16.6667		
(0yrs 3mths Rent Free)		PV 0yrs 3mths	@	6.0000%	0.9855	5,373,155	
Plot 1A Ground rents	4.070	VD		4.50000/	00 0000	07.444	
Current Rent	1,670	YP	@	4.5000%	22.2222	37,111	
Building 2 flexible use Market Rent	214,445	YP	<b>@</b>	6.0000%	16.6667		
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)	214,445	PV 0yrs 9mths	-	6.0000%	0.9572	3,421,254	
Builidng 4 flexible use		i v oyio oiiitiio		0.000070	0.0072	0,421,204	
Market Rent	149,905	YP	@	6.0000%	16.6667		
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)	,	PV 0yrs 9mths		6.0000%	0.9572	2,391,583	
School land receipt		,					
Manual Value						5,900,000	
Building 5 flexible use							
Market Rent	181,965			5.5000%	18.1818		
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)		PV 0yrs 9mths	@	5.5000%	0.9606	3,178,234	
Plot 1B Ground rents	. =-		0	4 = 2 2 2 2 2 2	66 F==:		
Current Rent	1,700	YP	@	4.5000%	22.2222	37,778	
Building 5 office  Market Rent	730,480	YP	<b>⋒</b>	6.0000%	16.6667		
(2yrs Rent Free)	130,400	PV 2yrs		6.0000%	0.8900	10,835,410	
(=).0 ((0.11.100)		1 v Zy13	_	3.000070	0.0000	10,000,410	

# **APPRAISAL SUMMARY**

## **LICENSED COPY**

Stag brewery	Stag	<b>Brewery</b>
--------------	------	----------------

_	•		
Cumulative	changes	20 June	2019

Building 5 hotel					
Manual Value					13,215,000
Building 6 flexible use					
Market Rent 143		P @	6.0000%	16.6667	
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)	PV 0yrs 9mt	hs @	6.0000%	0.9572	2,291,631
Building 7 flexible use					
Market Rent 201	1,775 Y	P @	6.0000%	16.6667	
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)	PV 0yrs 9mt	hs @	6.0000%	0.9572	3,219,117
Building 8 Affordable flexible use	•				
Market Rent 142	2,140 Y	P @	6.0000%	16.6667	
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)	PV 0yrs 9mt	hs @	6.0000%	0.9572	2,267,700
Building 10 flexible use	·				
Market Rent 76	6,450 Y	P @	6.0000%	16.6667	
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)	PV 0yrs 9mt	hs @	6.0000%	0.9572	1,219,683
Plot 1C Ground rents	·				
Current Rent	920 Y	P @	4.5000%	22.2222	20,444
Building 9 flexible use					•
	2,315 Y	P @	6.0000%	16.6667	
(0yrs 9mths Rent Free)	PV 0yrs 9mt	hs @	6.0000%	0.9572	1,791,873
Building 11 flexible use	.,				, - ,
	2,088 Y	P @	6.0000%	16.6667	
(Oyrs 9mths Rent Free)	PV 0yrs 9mt	hs @	6.0000%	0.9572	1,788,243
Building 12 flexible use			0.000070	0.00.2	.,. 00,2 .0
	1,463 Y	P @	6.0000%	16.6667	
(Oyrs 9mths Rent Free)	PV 0yrs 9mt	_	6.0000%	0.9572	1,937,812
(cyto official foot	i v oyis siin	10 😊	0.000070	0.5572	58,926,027

## **GROSS DEVELOPMENT VALUE**

Purchaser's Costs

6.80% (3,605,770)

(3,605,770)

889,036,583

## **NET DEVELOPMENT VALUE**

885,430,813

52,940,760

NET REALISATION 885,430,813

OUTLAY

**ACQUISITION COSTS** 

Fixed Price		49,570,000
Stamp Duty	5.00%	2,478,500
Agent Fee	1.00%	495,700
Legal Fee	0.80%	396,560

**CONSTRUCTION COSTS** 

ft <sup>2</sup>	Rate ft <sup>2</sup>	Cost
22,821 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	7,202,764
7,005 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	2,210,918
5,039 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,590,409
6,117 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,930,648
26,089 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	8,234,210
18,003 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	5,682,107
4,902 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,547,169
6,792 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	2,143,691
5,574 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,759,266
3,545 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,118,873
3,775 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,191,465
3,516 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,109,720
3,811 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	1,202,828
117,436 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	37,065,150
54,877 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	17,320,279
31,945 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	10,082,481
22,486 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	7,097,031
81,446 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	25,705,987
90,379 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	28,525,420
33,685 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	10,631,660
18,077 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	5,705,463
49,582 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	15,649,071
44,559 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	14,063,712
37,356 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	11,790,301
51,345 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	16,205,509
50,608 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	15,972,897
	22,821 ft² 7,005 ft² 5,039 ft² 6,117 ft² 26,089 ft² 18,003 ft² 4,902 ft² 6,792 ft² 5,574 ft² 3,545 ft² 3,775 ft² 3,516 ft² 3,811 ft² 117,436 ft² 54,877 ft² 31,945 ft² 22,486 ft² 81,446 ft² 90,379 ft² 33,685 ft² 18,077 ft² 49,582 ft² 44,559 ft² 37,356 ft² 51,345 ft²	22,821 ft² 315.62 pf² 7,005 ft² 315.62 pf² 5,039 ft² 315.62 pf² 6,117 ft² 315.62 pf² 26,089 ft² 315.62 pf² 18,003 ft² 315.62 pf² 4,902 ft² 315.62 pf² 6,792 ft² 315.62 pf² 3,545 ft² 315.62 pf² 3,516 ft² 315.62 pf² 3,811 ft² 315.62 pf² 3,811 ft² 315.62 pf² 317,436 ft² 315.62 pf² 54,877 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,945 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,466 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,465 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,465 ft² 315.62 pf² 41,465 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,685 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,685 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,685 ft² 315.62 pf² 31,562 pf² 31,345 ft² 315.62 pf²

# **APPRAISAL SUMMARY**

# LICENSED COPY

Stag	<b>Brewery</b>
------	----------------

_	•		
Cumulative	changes	20 June 2019	9

Cumulative changes 20 June 2019				
Building 16 Extracare	59,035 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	18,632,627	
Building 17 Extracare	63,872 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	20,159,281	
Building 18 affordable residential	159,649 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	50,388,417	
Building 19 residential	67,390 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	21,269,632	
Building 20 residential (houses)	28,137 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	8,880,600	
Building 21 residential (houses)	13,977 ft <sup>2</sup>	315.62 pf <sup>2</sup>	4,411,421	
Totals	1,192,830 ft <sup>2</sup>	010.02 pi		376,481,005
Totalo	1,102,000 10		0.0,.0.,000	0.0,.0.,000
Developers Contingency		2.50%	11,708,506	
Demolition		2.0070	4,110,000	
Bomonicon			1,110,000	15,818,506
Other Construction				10,010,000
Infrastructure works			24,324,300	
Basement			47,498,544	
Ph 1 Highways and pavements			7,193,550	
Capital contribution to cinema fito			1,000,000	
•				
Ph 1 highways and pavements			6,638,100	
Ph 1 highways and pavements			2,094,750	00 740 044
Municipal Coata				88,749,244
Municipal Costs			40 000 050	
CIL (Borough and Mayoral) Ph 1			12,226,952	
Carbon offset			2,295,000	
TFL bus contribution			3,675,000	
TFL bus infra enhancements			100,500	
TFL A205 public realm improvements			111,439	
LBRUT CPZ cost			65,000	
Healthcare contribution			720,980	
CIL Borough and Mayoral (Ph 2)			24,457,176	
				43,652,047
PROFESSIONAL FEES				
Professional fees		10.00%	46,834,025	
				46,834,025
MARKETING & LETTING				
Marketing		2.00%	14,361,755	
Letting Agent Fee		10.00%	284,091	
Letting Legal Fee		5.00%	284,601	
				14,930,446
DISPOSAL FEES				
Sales Agent Fee		1.00%	8,795,308	
Sales Legal Fee		0.50%	4,397,654	
Ŭ				13,192,962
FINANCE				, ,
Debit Rate 6.000% Credit Rate 0.000% (Nom	inal)			
Total Finance Cost	,			62,722,316
				,, •

**TOTAL COSTS** 715,321,311

PROFIT

170,109,503

## **Performance Measures**

Profit on Cost%	23.78%
Profit on GDV%	19.13%
Profit on NDV%	19.21%
Development Yield% (on Rent)	0.35%
Equivalent Yield% (Nominal)	5.96%
Equivalent Yield% (True)	6.19%
IRR	16.66%
Rent Cover Profit Erosion (finance rate 6.000%)	67 yrs 7 mths 3 yrs 7 mths